Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN)

Title of Report: SBMC Research

Report Number: ESSPIN 401

February, 2009

Report Distribution and Revision Sheet

Project Name: Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria

Report Title: School Based Management Committees Research Feb. 2009

Report No: ESSPIN 401

Rev No*	Date of issue	Originators	Checker	Approver	Scope of checking
1	Feb 2009	Helen Poulsen	Fatima Aboki	Steve Baines	Formatting/Content

Distribution List

Name	Position
DFID	
Kathleen Richmond	Human Development Programme Coordinator, DFID
Ian Attfield	Education Adviser, DFID Northern Nigeria Office
Isaac Adejo	Programme Officer, Human Development Team, DFID
ESSPIN	
John Martin	National Programme Manager
Richard Hanson	Assistant Programme Manager
Nick Santcross	Deputy Programme Manager
Steve Baines	Technical Team Coordinator
Abolaji Osime	State Team Leader Lagos
Emma Williams	State Team Leader Kwara
Richard Dalgarno	State Team Leader Kano
Steve Bradley	State Team Leader Kaduna
Kayode Sanni	State Team Leader Jigawa
John Kay	Lead Specialist Education Quality
Alero Ayida-Otobo	Lead Specialist Policy and Planning -Federal Level
Fatima Aboki	Lead Specialist Community Interaction
Nguyan Feese	Lead Specialist Inst. Development and Education Mgt
Francis Watkins	Lead Specialist Social Development
Musa Mohammed Hadejia	A & E Specialist Jigawa
Hadiza Umar	A & E Specialist Kaduna
Nura Usman Mohammed	A & E Specialist Kano
Olufunke Bolaji	A & E Specialist Kwara
Abiodun Fowomola	A & E Specialist Lagos

Quality Assurance Sheet and Disclaimer

Note on Documentary Series

This document is one of the series to be produced by Cambridge Education Consultants in support of their contract with the Department for International Development for the Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria
The documents include:

ESSPIN 001	ESSPIN 1st Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 002	MTSS Strategy
ESSPIN 003	M&E Strategy
ESSPIN 004	Inception Strategy
ESSPIN 005	Initial Report from the MTSS Task Team Leader
ESSPIN 006	ESSPIN 3rd Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 007	Support to completion of MTSS in Lagos and Kwara States
ESSPIN 008	National Consultant Capacity Building Programme
ESSPIN 009	Service to support the completion of MTSS in Lagos State.
ESSPIN 010	Institutional Development, Public Finance Management – Scoping Visit
ESSPIN 011	Development of State – level Logframe for Kano and Jigawa States
ESSPIN 201	Analysis of the Role of LGAs and LGEAs in Supporting Basic Education in Nigeria
ESSPIN 301	Teaching and Learning Survey
ESSPIN 302	School Infrastructure and Maintenance Review for ESSPIN States
ESSPIN 401	School Based Management Committees Research Feb. 09
ESSPIN 501	Communications and Knowledge Management Strategy
ESSPIN 502	Communication Task Specialist Visit Report Dec. 08
ESSPIN 503	Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) - Scoping Mission
ESSPIN 504	Communication Task Specialist Visit Report Feb. 09
KW 301	An Assessment of the Development needs of Teachers in Nigeria – Kwara State Case Study
KW 302	Oro College Review of Strategic Priorities
KW 303	Curriculum Transformation college of Education Oro
KW 304	Towards a Transformed Pre-Service Teacher Education Curriculum for College of Education Oro
KW 305	Institutional Strengthening of Oro College

Contents

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ESSPIN	Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria
JSS	Junior Secondary School
LGA	Local Government Area
LGEA	Local Government Education Authority
SBMC	School Based Management Committee
SUBEB	State Universal Basic Education Board

Abstract

1. This is a report of a consultancy to set up research on School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) under Component 4 of ESSPIN. Five state research teams were orientated during the consultancy, and draft tools piloted. The outcome of the consultancy is a research manual, which is included as an annex to this report. The main phase of the research will be conducted from 16th March – 4th April 2009 in all five ESSPIN states.

Executive Summary

2. This is the report on a consultancy to set up SBMC research, conducted from 11th - 23rd February 2009. The purpose of the consultancy was to develop detailed methodology and tools, train researchers, pilot the tools, review and finalise the tools and develop future plans.

3. Prior to arrival, the International Consultant had drafted a conceptual framework and tools. Meetings were held with five state research consultants, who will lead the research at state level, on Feb 15th – 16th to orientate them to the research. The tools were further developed according to their comments and suggestions. A piloting workshop was then held at Mumbayya House, Kano from 17th – 23rd February to train research teams, to pilot the tools and to plan for the main phase of the research. The tools were piloted in five schools in Kano state. Following this workshop and based on feedback and experiences from piloting, the International Consultant further amended and finalised the tools. The final outcome of the consultancy is a Research Manual and an agreed plan for the main phase of research.

4. During this process, concerns were raised about the small number of case studies in the proposed research and the long period of time (5 days) to be spent in each school. These concerns were addressed during the workshop and piloting. Some very interesting findings emerged through the piloting process, in particular around the representation of women on SBMCs and the functioning of SBMCs in relation to the power and authority of traditional leaders.

5. Agreement was reached with the research teams and State Team Leaders that the main phase of the research will be conducted from 16th March – 4th April 2009, and the analysis workshop will be conducted from 14th April – 19th April 2009.

Purpose of the Consultancy

6. The purpose of the consultancy was to set up the SBMC research. This included the development of detailed methodology and tools, training of researchers, piloting of tools, finalising of tools and the development of future plans.

Achievement of the terms of reference

TOR tasks	Progress made and agreements reached (with whom)	Proposed/ agreed follow up (by whom and when)
Phase 1 A review of the literature on the impact and effectiveness of community participation initiatives, including SBMCs, in Nigeria will be conducted.	Ongoing	
Phase 2 Methodology & research tools drafted	Done	-
Researchers trained	Done	-
Tools piloted	Done	-
Tools finalised	Done	
Plans for subsequent phases of the research will be agreed between the international consultant and ESSPIN	Done	Plans discussed with all State TLs except for Bolaji (Lagos).

Background

7. The School Based Management Committee research is a piece of qualitative research which seeks to clarify how this policy is understood at different levels of the system, and how it is enacted on the ground with particular attention to implications for gender, poverty and the provision of quality education (see Annex 1 for TORs).

8. The methodology is based on in-depth case studies in 10 schools in ESSPIN states, as well as interviews with key individuals at Federal, State, LGEA level and a literature review (see Annex 2 for conceptual framework; Annex 3 for research manual).

9. This phase of the research involved training 5 field teams, one for each ESSPIN state, and piloting the research methodology. Training and piloting took place over a 9-day period from 15th – 23rd February 2009 in Kano (see Annex 4 for training programme and materials). Each state team consisted of three people: a state research consultant, the ESSPIN state access & equity specialist, plus one field researcher and in some cases one SUBEB official. The training period consisted of 2 days orientation, followed by 5 days piloting and review, and one day for planning the main phase of the research.

Findings and Issues Arising

10. The methodological approach, conceptual framework and research tools were shared with State Research consultants and amended prior to piloting. One key issue that arose in was a concern about the small number of case studies and the length of time to be spent in each school. The rationale for selecting just 10 case studies is as follows. Much past research on school management committees internationally has been very superficial, involving perhaps a few questions posed to Headteacher and Chair. These studies tell us very little about how these institutions – upon which great expectations are heaped – actually function – i.e. who makes decisions; who holds the power? This research is conceived as an antidote to such research & starts from the assumption that there is conflict and difference at the community level which will be reflected in the operation of SBMCs and similar institutions. The methodology, which draws on ethnography, institutional analysis & PRA techniques, focuses on relationships within and between these institutions & requires the perspective of diverse stakeholders, including those with less influence and less voice.

11. This approach requires the use of a range of different tools and activities, with a range of different stakeholder groups, spread over a five day period. The long research period has been designed for the following reasons: 1) there is more chance of 'shaking off' influential guides e.g. LGEA representatives who tend to dominate discussions; 2) members of the school and community will become used

to the researchers and will feel comfortable in their discussions; 3) time for reflection and analysis for researchers is built into each day so that when they return the next day, they can pursue issues arising; 4) there is time in the schedule for them to take advantage of opportunities that arise to pursue key issues or individuals; 5) there is time built in for a feedback meeting at which researchers share findings at a community meeting and invite feedback and questions, a which is good practice from an ethical perspective.

12. Some members of the research team expressed concern that the number of case studies is too small for the purposes of making generalisations. Their concerns were discussed at length and I have argued that 1) in order for a sample of primary schools to be representative in a statistical sense would require a very large sample indeed and that 2) since this is a qualitative study our concern is more with documenting the situation and linking it clearly to context: i.e. what works, where, and why. In addition, (3) a broader perspective will be introduced through the literature review and interviews with federal, state and LGEA representatives.

13. While for the most part, the research teams were well-balanced, the Jigawa team had no female member. During piloting this proved to be problematic and it was therefore agreed that an additional, female researcher would be recruited by the Jigawa Team Leader.

14. The research tools were piloted with the state research teams in five schools in Kano state. The teams then met in the afternoons to review methodological issues arising. Findings were presented by each team at the end of the piloting process and each state consultant produced a report on the pilot (See Annex 5 for pilot reports).

15. Much rich and interesting material came out of the piloting process, including the following:

- Home-grown community-based education organisations: In at least two of the pilot schools, 'home-grown' community-based organisations were found to be operating with a focus on education. These organisations would not be picked up in a survey or research focused exclusively on SBMCs. This showed that our tools needed to broaden their focus and to focus at community level on the variety of organisations, including SBMCs, that deal with education. This is important in relation to ESSPIN strategy because it shows that SBMCs are not being introduced into a void; rather they must complement and work with existing organisations.
- Traditional authority and SBMCs: in Panda (Albasu LGA) the village head is a former LGA official, chair of the Panda Education Development Forum, chair of the SBMC, and with a clear and progressive vision for education in his village. Under his leadership, the problem of low transition of girls to Secondary schooling has been identified and addressed through the foundation of a girls' JSS. As a result, enrolment of girls in the area is high (anecdotally). However, no female membership of the SBMC is

countenanced, because it is 'dangerous' for men and women to meet together. This is not a blanket ban however, since women who are teachers (including the Chief's sister) are allowed to attend PTA meetings. This presents the interesting paradox that while traditional leadership is by definition non-democratic and conservative, it can be used towards progressive goals (e.g. the education of girls), and suggests that SBMC strategy needs to work with traditional authority and to persuade it to focus in the direction of more equitable, higher quality education.

- Representation of women on SBMCs: in all the pilot schools the requirement for women's representation was largely ignored. It would be simplistic to view this as simply a lack of information at school level; clearly it runs counter to cultural practices but the evidence suggests that it is not insurmountable. At Bechi Primary School (Kumbotso LGA) a meeting with the local Women Development Association revealed that the women were angry about the fact that they had no forum for discussing their concerns about the school or their children's education and very much wanted to participate in SBMC meetings, but had not been invited. Some members came to the feedback meeting which team members viewed as an extremely positive step.

- Change: in many of the pilot schools changes were initiated during the research process. For example at Bechi, re-elections were held as a direct result of the presence of the researchers.

16. Sampling: the selection of case study schools was discussed with the research teams.

17. The following outline was agreed:

		Interventions	location
Kano 1	Primary	None	Peri-urban
Kano 2	Primary	SESP	Rural
Kaduna 1	Primary	SESP	Peri-urban
Kaduna 2	Primary	None	Rural
Kwara 1	Primary	SESP	Urban
Kwara 2	Primary	none	Rural
Jigawa 1	Primary	GEP 1	Rural
Jigawa 2	Primary	GEP 2	Rural
Lagos 1	Primary	COMPASS	Urban
Lagos 2	JSS	None	Urban

18. In addition, researchers were asked to avoid well resourced model primary schools and special primary schools.

19. The participation of SUBEB officials from Kano, Kaduna and Jigawa added a great deal of value to the piloting and tools development process. In addition it is clearly a positive indication of commitment to work in partnership with ESSPIN

Options and Next Steps

1. Plans: state teams developed detailed plans during the last day of the workshop. Overall plans were discussed directly with State Team Leaders (with the exception of Bolaji who was not contactable on the day) and an email sent (See Annex 6). In summary:

    - The main phase of the research will be conducted 16th March – 4th April (see Annex 3: research manual for details)
    - An analysis workshop for State Research Consultants will be held in Abuja 14th – 19th April.
    - Next visit of the International consultant will be from 23rd – 28th March to Lagos and Kwara states to monitor the main phase of the research.
    - The international consultant will plan to visit again from 13th – 22nd April for the purposes of analysis and presentation of preliminary findings.
    - In addition an abstract will be submitted to the UKFIET conference by HP & FA for a presentation on "SBMC research in Nigeria: perspectives from research & implementation".

Annexes

1. *TORs*
2. *Conceptual framework*
3. *Final research manual*
4. *Training programme & materials*
5. *Pilot reports*
6. Email to ESSPIN team leaders

Annex 1:   Terms of Reference

Title of Assignment: School Based Management Committee Research
Location of Assignment: Abuja, Lagos, Kano, Kwara, Kaduna and Jigawa States
Duration: 75 days
Background
Despite the possession of considerable oil wealth, a rising population, inefficient government investment in front line public services and years of neglect have left the Nigerian education system in a poor state. Education indicators are amongst the lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa, particularly for girls. Currently it is estimated that there are 7-9 million school aged children not attending school, a disproportionate percentage of whom are girls. Since legislation was passed in 2004 establishing nine-year compulsory Universal Basic Education, the main sectoral focus of Federal and State governments has been an expansion of basic education to meet the Millennium Development Goals.   There has been a significant increase in investment in the basic education sector through State governments and through Federal sources such as the Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC). Access remains a problem, as do the low quality of education outcomes and the stark inequities in the system. The Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN) is a six year DFID programme of education development assistance and is a part of a suite of programmes aimed at improvements in governance and the delivery of basic services. ESSPIN's aim is to have a sustainable impact upon the way in which government in Nigeria delivers education services and is directed at enabling institutions to bring about systemic change in the education system, leveraging Nigerian resources in support of State and Federal Education Sector Plans and building capacity for sustainability. It is currently operating in five States (Kano, Kaduna, Kwara, Jigawa and Lagos) and at the Federal level. ESSPIN builds upon previous technical assistance projects in education, in particular the Capacity for Universal Basic Education Project (CUBE). ESSPIN will run in parallel with World Bank credit-funded projects in four of the States (the State Education Sector Project (SESP) in Kano, Kaduna and Kwara and SESP II in Lagos).

Objectives of the assignment
The main objectives of this consultancy are: (1) to provide a comprehensive analysis of the status of school-based management committees in ESSPIN states so as to form a strong analytical foundation, and (2) to explore the way forward to further expand and strengthen SBMC for improving education service delivery and outcome.

Specific task for the consultancy (See details attached as annex)

- To provide technical and professional lead in the design of School Based Management Committee research in collaboration with National consultants and state teams. This will include; developing criteria for selection of sample LGA/School communities, training of field researchers, develop field reporting format, piloting the draft instruments and conduct a review of the instruments in Kano state.
- Coordinate and supervise the field research in 5 states whilst at the same time carrying out document desk review
- Facilitate the collation and analysis of data and information using agreed format
- Produce preliminary and progress reports.
- Produce a draft and finalize reports of a consolidated 5 states to ESSPIN
- Debrief ESSPIN and other stakeholders on outcomes and recommendations
- Develop strategies for ESSPIN implementation phase

Outputs

1. Summary reports of the each phase and of the consultancy will be shared and discussed by the international consultant, the Lead Specialist and Community Interaction prior to departure from Nigeria. The consultant will also ensure that the Lead Specialist and the Technical Team Leader are fully informed throughout the period of the consultancy.

2. A draft analytical report of the consultancy will be submitted within 14 days of the completion of this consultancy and summary presentation to ESSPIN and other key stakeholders for comments.

3. A final report on the process, analysis undertaken in each of the states, the strategies and action plans to take forward commitments on support to SBMCs in ESSPIN states are expected within two weeks of the completion of this assignment. The report should be submitted electronically by email, in Microsoft Word, font Arial – size; 12.

Institutional/administrative arrangements

The consultant will report to the Lead Specialist Community Interaction and will undertake this assignment in 6 phases: an initial planning and pilot visit to work with National consultants and field researchers in Kano state. The consultant will coordinate and undertake actual field work in Kaduna, Jigawa, Kwara and Lagos States. Collaborate with the co researchers to analysis field data, debrief and submit a report.

Timing, venue and duration of the Consultancy

This assignment is expected to be undertaken in phases, spread across coming months (February – June 2009). The process will begin with an initial ten (10) day's work in February during which plans for subsequent phases of the research will be agreed between the international consultant and ESSPIN.

Timing (tentative)

2 weeks in February 2009
2 weeks in March 2009
2 week in April 2009
1 week in May/June 2009
1 week in June/July 2009

Venue

ESSPIN states, (Kano, Kaduna, Kwara, Lagos and Jigawa), other relevant federal agencies and in particular UBEC, State MoEs, SUBEB, CSO, MDG office, LGEAs and school/communities.

Competencies

Qualifications/experience

1. A postgraduate qualification in education, social development or development management and experience of strategies to community participation and social service delivery.
2. Extensive practical experience of community interactions and school development management structures in developing countries.
3. Experience of providing professional and technical inputs in development assistance programmes/projects.

Knowledge

1. Practical knowledge of educational development issues in Nigeria and other countries.
2. In-depth knowledge and experience of current international literature on school Based management and governance.
3. Knowledge of Nigerian Government and parastatal structures and systems.
4. Experience of School Based Management Committees initiatives in resource poor environments in developing countries (essential), preferably in Nigeria (desirable)

Abilities

1. Ability to communicate appropriately with clients and stakeholders and to elicit reliable information.
2. Ability to inspire colleagues and to act as member of a team.
3. Ability to design and facilitate/implement an investigation into the outcomes and effectiveness of school based management committees.
4. Ability to design and facilitate participative and interactive workshops

Annex A

School Based Management Committees (SBMCS) in policy and practice in Nigeria

Background

- **Rationale**

The problems of Nigeria's education system are well documented. There is poor access to education, particularly for girls and the poorest citizens. Net primary school attendance was only 64% for boys and 57% for girls in 2003. In the north in particular, the situation is worse – only 34% of girls attend school[1]. For those who do have access, the quality of education is poor[2].

School Management Committees are promoted in international and national development policy as a way to improve the quality of education provision and to promote democracy at the local level. International experience suggests that SBMCs can, in certain conditions, be linked to improvements but the evidence is limited and in some cases contradictory.

In Nigeria, recent changes in education policy have sought to introduce School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) across the country. A number of different programmes and initiatives have been supporting the establishment and functioning of SBMCs (e.g. GEP, ActionAid, CSACEFA, CAPP projects). There is, however, a lack of research on whether and how SBMC policy is being implemented on the ground, and what effect SBMCs are having on communities and on schools.

The DfID-supported Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN) project provides an important opportunity to review what has been done so far and what shape future support to SBMCs might take. This research, therefore, seeks to clarify how this policy is understood at different levels of the system, and how it is enacted on the ground with particular attention to implications for gender, poverty and the provision of quality education.

- **Brief overview of the literature**

Recent years have seen an increased focus on community participation in education in international development policy and practice. Bray[3] suggests that this increase should be seen in the context of a worldwide shift by the 1980s towards privatisation in the public sector, including education, because government operations were seen as inefficient and unresponsive to changing circumstances. One of the reasons why the trend towards community-based solutions was attractive to governments was that it meant parents, communities and civil society taking on some of the financial and other burdens of education. In terms of outcomes, Bray notes positive results in terms of recruitment, retention and attendance of pupils, and improved learning outcomes. However, his findings indicate that there are aspects of school effectiveness where community impact is limited, for example in supply and training of teachers. He further notes that community participation can increase geographical and social disparities between communities, 'because the groups that are already advantaged are in a better position to help themselves than the disadvantaged groups'.

---

[1] World Bank. (2005). *Empowering people by transforming institutions: Social development in World Bank operations*.

[2] Federal Government of Nigeria. (2004). *Nigeria: National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy*. Abuja, Nigeria: National Planning Commission.

[3] Bray, M. (2000). Community Partnerships in Education: Dimensions, Variations and Implications. EFA thematic study. Dakar.

Rose's[4] study of the impact that community participation has had on improving gender equity in educational outcomes in sub-Saharan Africa indicates a mixed picture. There is evidence that *under the right conditions* community participation can contribute to increased rates of enrolment for girls. However, there is limited evidence for improved achievement and transition. Indeed, 'As an end in itself, community participation in schooling appears to have resulted in an entrenchment and reinforcement of gender relations, rather than empowering those traditionally excluded from more genuine aspects of participation'.

Burde[5] notes that approaches to community participation in education are often not well implemented and have unrealistic aims and objectives. It is 'a complex tool that can be manipulated in multiple ways to varying effect… To the extent that it works to increase the efficiency and quality of social services, participation may provide a patchwork solution to systemic problems, veiling more profound and contentious issues of structural change and political representation'. Burde therefore argues that community participation should complement and check the state, not replace it. In summary, the evidence from these selected sources suggests that the impact of community participation as a strategy is mixed, with a strong indication of the need to retain a focus on understanding the communities as unique and differentiated, if school management committees and other community participation initiatives are to be successful. The other indication is that community participation strategies are not the solution to educational problems; but they might be useful as part of a range of strategies to tackling complex problems. A more comprehensive review of the national and international literature will be required to confirm these early conclusions.

The theoretical approach of this study draws on critical policy analysis, gender theory and critical approaches to community. For example, it will employ the concept of recontextualisation[6]: that is, the ways in which policies change when they interact with new contexts. Crucial to this is an analysis of 'fields of contest', that is, the disputes and conflicts that take place at national, local and institutional levels, their changing relationships and their inter-penetration[7]. It is also informed by literature on gender and development which views an understanding of the gendered power relations as crucial to analysing and understanding institutions. In addition the research is informed by a critical approach to the concept of community; that is, one that questions a unitary and homogeneous view of community.

Research questions

- What are the key policies around SBMCs in Nigeria, and how are they understood by key stakeholders at federal, state, local government, school and community levels?
- How have these policies been 'enacted' at school and community level?
- What are the implications of the ways in which SBMC policy has been implemented for questions of gender, poverty and school governance?
- What strategies do the findings suggest for future ESSPIN research and engagement with SBMCs?

Methodology

---

[4] Rose, P. (2003). Communities, gender and education: Evidence from sub-Saharan Africa. Background paper for 2003 UNESCO Global Monitoring Report.

[5] Burde, D. (2004). "Weak state, strong community? Promoting community participation in post-conflict countries." Current issues in comparative education **6**(2).

[6] See e.g. Bernstein, B. (1990). The structuring of pedagogic discourse. London, Routledge.

[7] Ball, S. (1998). Big Policies/Small World: An Introduction to International Perspectives in Education Policy. *Comparative Education, 34*(2).

Phase 1: Literature review

A review of the literature on the impact and effectiveness of community participation initiatives, including SBMCs, in Nigeria will be conducted. This review will feed into the Situational Analysis of Basic Education Service Delivery in Nigeria, to be conducted as part of the research strategy for the inception phase. [8]

Phase 2: Setting up the research.

During this preliminary phase, TORs for the field researchers will be developed, and field and state researchers will be recruited; detailed methodology and tools will be developed, researchers will be trained and tools will be piloted. Training and piloting will take place in one of the study states.

Phase 3: Field research

Field research will be conducted in Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Kwara and Lagos states. This will be a qualitative piece of research because it seeks to explore what is happening and why at school community level in relation to SBMCs. In-depth case studies will be conducted in two communities in each of the four study states – 10 case studies in total. These case studies will use a mixture of methodological approaches including interviews, observation and participatory research to develop a detailed SBMC, school and community profiles. These profiles will help to clarify questions about who SBMC members are, what kind of activities they are involved in and why, how they see their roles, and what relationships exist between SBMC members, different community members, teachers, parents and others. We envisage the development of a SBMC profiling 'tool' which could be used more broadly and/or used to revisit these communities over a period of time to track changes.

A crucial element of this research will be the opportunity it presents for capacity building within state ministries of education and Local Government Authorities (LGAs). The research will therefore be conducted by one state/LGA official (state researcher) and one field researcher, supported by State Consultants in each of the five states. Researchers will work in state-based pairs. Each pair will spend 5 days in each community, 3 days interviewing LGA & state officials, plus 2 days writing up time – i.e. 15 working days in each state.

At federal, state and local government level, semi-structured interviews will be conducted with government officials and representatives of NGOs and donor organisations to explore understandings of SBMC policy.

Phase 4: Analysis

Analysis will be conducted collaboratively over a 2-week period by the full research team,. This is based on the belief that research findings with a large team of researchers working in diverse contexts are best discussed collaboratively at the initial stage of analysis in order to make best use of the data.

Phase 5: Writing up

The writing of the final report will be led by the lead researcher, with assistance from the rest of the research team. A full report and summary report will be produced.

Phase 6: Dissemination & design/planning of follow up

The following outputs are planned:

- A presentation of preliminary findings will be made after the analysis phase in mid April, timed to feed into the inception report of ESSPIN.
- A full and summary report will be produced by end of July.

---

[8] Akyeampong, K. (2009). *Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN). Research strategy for inception phase.* Abuja: ESSPIN. See Annex A for draft literature review questions.

- A conference paper will be developed for UKFIET 2009 – effect of EFA on communities theme – to be lead by CR with support of LR. This may also be developed into a journal paper.

There will be options to extend the research so that it can feed into ESSPIN research strategy & ESSPIN monitoring.

Annex B:

Draft questions for literature review

1 What are the different ways in which parents and community members have been involved in school management in the past, and why?

- Look at historical factors that shape present attitudes to community participation in schools especially the effects of military dictatorships & return of democracy
- Policy development
- Look at differences between states
- PTAs
- Other arrangements, formal or informal
- SBMCs formed as a result of the 2007 order but without support or training
- Look at key projects & initiatives that have included a focus on SBMCs or their precursors including Self Help, CUBE initiatives, GEP, CSACEFA, CAPP, ActionAid, government training & others.

2 What are the documented results of that involvement (and what remains undocumented), and why?

- What evaluations of projects and interventions mentioned in (1) are available?
- What indicators were used to monitor and evaluate SBMCs, with what results?
- What evidence, if any, is there that SBMCs had an impact on:
    - o Enrolment (by gender, poorer children)
    - o Achievement (by gender, poorer children)
    - o Participation of men, women, poorer community members in decision making
- What reasons, if any, are given for those impacts
- How convincing is the evidence?
- Where projects & initiatives have not been evaluated or documented, is any other evidence available (anecdotal, statistical, other)?
- Where projects and initiatives have finished is there evidence of any on-going impact, and if so, what?

3 What lessons can be drawn for future interventions?

- Structure, roles & responsibilities
- Systems of accountability
- Incentives
- Women/children participation and representation
- Strategies that support enrolment, attendance, equity, participation

Annex 2:   Conceptual Framework

This note lays out the key concepts around which the fieldwork and analysis will be organised.

Research questions
1. What are the key policies around SBMCs in Nigeria, and how are they understood by key stakeholders at federal, state, local government, school and community levels?
2. How have these policies been 'enacted' at school and community level?
3. What are the implications of the ways in which SBMC policy has been implemented for questions of gender, poverty and school governance?
4. What strategies do the findings suggest for future ESSPIN research and engagement with SBMCs?

---

1. The research questions (boxed above) suggest that the research needs to approach SBMCs from a number of different angles:

1 **understanding** of SBMCs and community participation;

2 **enactment** of SBMC policy

3 **impact** of SBMC policy

4 **future** of SBMC policy (NB policy understood in a very broad sense, not just government policy)

These angles suggest a clear structure to individual and group interviews and focus group discussions.

2. Another key set of issues is around **power, conflict and change**. These issues derive from a set of influences including 1) an assumption that understanding power dynamics within key institutions (including SBMCs and schools) is important ; 2) an understanding of policy as discourses which exercise power through the production of truth and knowledge and 3) analysis of 'fields of contest', that is, the disputes and conflicts that take place at national, local and institutional levels, their changing relationships and their inter-penetration9. These issues are of interest at both the level of individual and institutional relationships, which suggests the use of individual interviews as well as tools drawn from PRA/PLA that focus on institutions. It also suggests that field researchers will need to be alert to picking up and exploring issues of conflict as they come up and will need to be skilled in terms of handling them.

3. A further set of issues is focused around the question of **community participation** and how to understand and evaluate it. A useful approach is suggested by Wilson & Wilde (2003)[10] in their analysis of community participation through the concepts of influence, inclusivity, communication and capacity (resources):

---

9 Ball, S. (1998). Big Policies/Small World: An Introduction to International Perspectives in Education Policy. Comparative Education, 34(2).

10 Wilson, M. & Wilde, P. (2003) Benchmarking community participation: Developing and implementing the Active Partners benchmarks. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Resources	Inclusivity
• Financial & other material resources • Skills & capacity • Training and support • Networks • Motivation & reward	• Membership • Processes of formation • Role of women • Role of poor
Communication	**Influence**
• Profile & presence of SBMC • Communication of SBMC decisions • Communication between school and SBMC • Communication between LGA & SBMC • Tensions & conflict	• Accountability • Within the SBMC, who makes the decisions • SBMC power and influence in relation to school and other local institutions (horizontal) • SBMC power and influence in relation to LGA (vertical) • Possibilities for promoting collective action for change

Proposed - four dimensions of community participation in education (adapted from Wilson & Wilde (2003: 7))

These categories suggest a way of organising and analysis SBMCs; however this 4-way model will need to be supplemented by (4) below.

4 A further element is the concern with s**chool governance.** Particular ESSPIN concerns are:

- autonomy to take decision on personnel management, school budget and expenditure,
- school maintenance of infrastructure and monitoring,
- best practices/enforcement,
- accountability mechanisms and
- capacity to govern/manage schools[11].

Key questions to be explored then are the extent to which SBMCs are involved with these aspects of school governance. McLennan (1997) defines school governance as:

> *the integrated management of the complex political, socio-economic and institutional relationships between people (the stakeholders of any particular sector), policy (normative and regulatory frameworks) and power (the*

---

11 Fatima Aboki, personal communication, 5/2/09

> *distribution and utilisation of power and authority networks) in order to ensure effective and efficient service delivery[12].*

This view of governance as a dynamic balance of power between three entities within the framework of an overall direction of better education is a helpful one. In addition, a key debate in the governance literature concerns the extent to which this diversified power does or does not address questions of collective action for social change (See e.g. Mundy 2007[13]).

These varied and complex influences suggest a varied set of methods that will seek to cover the above issues with a wide set of stakeholders at school, community and local government levels. An outline of those methods appears below.

---

12 McLennan A 1997. Education management development in South Africa: Trends and frameworks. In : Smith W J, Thurlow M & F orster W F (eds). Supporting education management in South Africa. International perspectives, Vol. 1. Selected themes in education management development. Johannesburg: CSAEM P.

[13] Mundy, K (2007) Basic Education, Civil Society Participation and the New Aid Architecture: Lessons from Burkina Faso, Kenya, Mali and Tanzania. Toronto: CIDA.

Annex 3:   Research Manual (linked pdf file)

ESSPIN
SBMCs in policy and practice

Research site (state, LGA, community):

....

Researcher names:

....

Annex 4:   Training Programme & Materials

TRAINING & PILOTING OUTLINE PLAN

Sunday 15th Feb	Introduction to the research (PhD) Experience & needs analysis Introduction to the methodology • Qualitative • Case studies • Reflexive • Gender Research timing Ethics Sampling Other sources of data	**FA** **SCs**
Monday 16th	Roles & responsibilities Logistics & planning Analysis Write up & presentation Training Field Researchers State level interviews	**FA** **SCs**
Tuesday 17th	1. Introductions 2. Introduction to the research 3. Introduction to tools 4. Roles & responsibilities 5. Timing 6. Methodological issues • Interviewing/listening skills • PRA • FGDs • Group feedback meeting • Recording 7. Ethics 8. Training & support needs 9. Prepare Day 1 tools	**SCs** **FRs**
Wednesday 18th	Pilot Day 1 Feedback & review Prepare Day 2 tools	
Thursday 19th	Pilot Day 2 Feedback & review Prepare Day 3 tools	
Friday 20th	Pilot Day 3 Feedback & review Prepare Day 4 tools	
Saturday 21st	Pilot Day 4 Feedback & review Prepare Day 5 tools	
Sunday 22nd	Pilot Day 5	

	Feedback & review	
Monday 23rd	Planning for main phase of research Any other issues Depart	

Presentation Tuesday 17th February (linked ppt file)

School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) in policy and practice

17th February 2009

Pilot plan

Tues 17th Feb	Workshop	
Weds 18th Feb	Tool 1: School profile. Gather school data from school registers on enrolment, attendance. Tool 2: Transect walk & social resource mapping	8.30 Enter – greet headteacher, village leader 9-11 social resource mapping - mixed group school staff, SBMC members, community members. 11-1 School profile 4-5 Feedback meeting Mumbayya House
Thurs 19th Feb	Tool 3: Interviews with Headteacher, 2 teachers (1 male, 1 female), SBMC chair, community leader, CBO/NGO representative.	9-10 HT 10-11 F teacher 11-12 SBMC chair 12-1 community leader 1-2 CBO/NGO leader 4-5 Feedback meeting
Fri 20th Feb	Tool 4: SBMC group meeting Tool 5: Individual Interviews with SBMC members (1m, if) Examine SBMC papers & meeting records Observe SBMC meeting (tba at later date)	9-10 SBMC group meeting 10-11 Individual meeting (F member) 11-12 Examine meeting records
Sat 21st Feb	Tool 6: Venn diagram: one men's group, one women's group	9-11 women's group 11-12 men's group 12-1 Feedback meeting

Plan for Monday 23rd February – wrap up

0900	Plan for the research: overview Changes I've made
0930	Things to do before fieldwork – planning in groups

	Feedback
1030	Things to do during the fieldwork • Ethics • Recording: write down quotations; reflections; feelings. • Discussion & analysis: come back to the research questions & analytical framework
1100	Coffee
1130	Sampling: in groups Feedback
1230	Things to do after the fieldwork • Prepare one set of completed field notes • Prepare your case study presentation • Reporting format
1300	Lunch
1400	Principles • Keep the big picture in mind • Look at what is happening, not what should be happening • Don't worry about strategies. Worry about understanding what is working and why • Tools and questions are a guideline only • Go off on tangents • Snoop • Think critically
1500	Any other questions Next steps Close
1530	Sit with NCs • Contacts • Reports/contracts • Other business

Annex 5a: Jigawa Team Pilot Report

DR. MICHAEL W. MUSA   - LEAD RESEARCHER
MUSA MUHAMMAD HADEJIA   - RESEARCHER
ABUBAKAR M. NASHABARU   - RESEARCHER

1. Background

Panda Primary School is located in the rural community of Panda in Albasu LGA of Kano State. The community has a low population density, comprising of inhabitants who are mostly Hausa and Fulani speaking people, and predominantly are Moslems. The major occupation is farming along side with off-farm activities such as civil service, livestock rearing, commuting services, petty trading, carpentry, food processing (mostly by women), crafts and brick making. Agricultural crops grown are millet, sorghum, rice, cowpea, maize and sugar cane. Livestock reared include: cattle, sheep, goats and poultry. The lifestyle of the people are based on some form of social organization and structure, characterized by a network of social relationships which are functionally differentiated and tied to a prevailing unique culture. The social arrangements peculiar to decision making and participation is governed by laws and principles recognized by all community members as promoting a balanced way of life crucial to their own continued existence.

Information generated by the use of school profile, transect walk and interview tools revealed that the school building is made up of four blocks of 6 classrooms in which streams of class rooms are compressed. Other facilities include school library, staff room, two-seater toilets, a well and an on-going construction of additional two-seater toilets by community efforts. The existing building structures are in good, which can largely be attributed to the relocation of the school from its original and historic location. School furniture appears adequate and in good condition as this has been provided through community efforts as well with support from Educational Trust Fund (ETF). Most of the teachers have low qualifications. The school has 21 teachers with a high gender disparity of 19 male teachers and 2 female teachers. Pupils enrolment rose up to a total 461(M=289: F=172) pupils in 2008/2009 but declined in attendance to 205 (M=143: F=62) pupils in the first term. In the second term attendance rose to 320 (M=212: F=110) pupils. This was recognized to be encouraging.

2. Structures in Panda Community that Support the Primary School

Findings revealed that the Panda primary school received institutional at the community level:
- The Panda Educational Development Forum (PEDF) an umbrella community based organization which works in line with the PTA and SBMC in supporting the development of the school.
- The Parents Teachers Association
- The School Based Management Committee (SBMC)
- Old Boys Association (OBA)
- Occupational based groups and cooperatives such as farmers' associations which work hand in hand with other with the SBMC, PTA and the PEDF
- Traditional institution which comprise an educated and versatile village head that supports educational development of the community under his jurisdiction. The Venn Diagram tool revealed that the village head is a key figure in the planning, management and development of the school.

3.   Resources

To a large extent, the opportunity structure of a community is determined by the available resource potentials. Findings from the Venn diagram, the Transect Walk, Interviews, Resource and Social Mapping revealed that Panda community has:

- an agile labour force
- Well educated members who have a strong will towards education and community development.
- Financial base accruing from farming and off- activities, support from community cohesiveness and organizations, with some form of support from State and LGA as well.
- Settlement patterns are characterised by elongated structures made up of cemented and mud materials, thatched and zinc roof, has dispensary, water tank, electric poles, abandoned police post structure, wide area of land for farming and livestock rearing.
- Members who possess durable items such motorcycles, bicycles, cars.
- Strong and functional community based associations such as PEDF, PTA and SBMC.

4.   Inclusivity

Membership in the PTA, PEDF and SBMC is male dominated. Though women play significant role in providing support, their importance is often undermined and not well highlighted as regards their membership, decision making process and participation in the activities of these associations. Reasons for women's non-active participation in these associations and SBMC are attributed to the socio-cultural factors which do not allow their women to mingle with men in public places. Findings show that pupils (Male and Female) and other important community figure such as the religious leader were not included in the membership of the SBMC and PTA. At the community level, the evidence of inclusivity is manifested by the strong linkage between the school, village head, PTA, PEDF and SBMC members. This is so because the membership composition of these organizations is made up of all or some of the same key members.

5.   Communication

There is a hierarchy in terms of communication flow in the community. However, findings from interviews carried out among various community members revealed that the linkages in the transfer and flow of information most especially about the SBMC appear weak. In most instances, information flow are verbalised with little documented. As such there is evidence of information insufficiency as regards to the thorough understanding of the membership composition of the SBMC. Findings from the Venn diagram revealed that the process of information transfer is both horizontal and vertical between and among members on the one hand, and between the community and the LGA on the other hand. As findings have shown, communication is centrally dominated (top-down) even though the evidence of 'bottom-up' flow of information (feedback) cannot be of ruled out.

6. Influence

It was observed that there are many interlocking and salient factors influencing the decision-making processes and actions. Among these are the issues of power relations, resource availability, its control and management. Decision making about education can be observed at different levels. One level of decision making is from the State into the community, while the other is at the community level with decisions taken centrally and collectively by members of SBMC, PTA, PEDF and occupational associations. Findings show that decision making is based on consultation and consensus.

4. REMARK

- Piloting of the instruments proved over 95% success. There is evidence of generating valuable information in the actual conduct of the SBMC research in the ESSPIN States.
- Difficulties encountered in different scenarios and locations, has given room for adjustments to be made so that salient issues can be deepened.

Annex 5b: Kaduna Team Report

1.0 BACKGROUND

This report presents findings from the pilot assessment of SBMC in a primary school in Kano. The report is structured to cover the background (the community and the school context), the structures in place to support the school, the situation of resources in the school, exclusivity, communication and influence in the school.

1.1 Location

State: ------------------------------------Kano
LGA: -----------------------------------Garun Mallam
School: ---------------------------------Special Primary School
Community: --------------------------Chiromawa Idi

1.2 Key Features of the Community

The community is in a semi urban area about 35kilometers from Kano city and on the way to Zaria. It has electricity, pipe borne water, a health centre, post office, a market situated near the road and a big filling station and a police post. The chief's house and the mosque are other prominent features of the community which were all identified on the social map by the community people.

The community has very large farm land with many farmers engaged in all sorts of farming activities both in the rainy and dry season. This explains why community members found it hard to give much of their time to the researchers though it is the dry season. Besides farmers, there are petty traders, artisans and transporters. Several organizations are also found in the community as revealed by the Venn diagram exercise.

1.3 School Features

1.3.1 Population of pupils/Teachers

The special primary school in community is quite big with a population of **2345** pupils – (Males: 1675 and Females: 670). This clearly shows gross inequality in the enrollment of boys and girls in the school. Due to the large number of pupils and the inadequate number of classrooms the school runs two shifts- morning and evening. Still to cope with the population, each class (i.e. level of study) has four arms whether in the morning or evening sessions. The total number of pupils in the school is 49 and the teacher pupil ratio is 48:1.

1.3.2 Facilities/materials

The school has quite large space for additional classrooms if it can afford. There are two foot ball fields for boys but no form of sports facility for the girls. This again shows inequality in the needs of boys and girls. However, there are toilets for both boys and girls, male and female teachers. There is also pipe borne water and a functioning borehole. Both the borehole and the pipe water were provided by a local NGO called Women Farmers Association of Nigeria, (WOFAN).

There is a teacher's room but without furniture, a first aid box in use but not well stocked. Classrooms have inadequate number of benches and pupils of the ECCP class in particular all seat on the floor and their teachers reported lack non availability of scheme of work, indoors and outdoor play facilities and materials. There is lack of teaching aids generally and

teachers resort to making some local ones. Students have the required number of exercise books for all subjects but have no text books. Teachers text books are however available.

2.0 COMMUNITY STRUCTURES

2.1 Community level
- Responses from different groups and individuals pointed to the following as key structures that work to support school development: The ECD – Education development committee which was rated as number 1 in its support for school development, followed by the PTA and the SBMC. Others include the old boys and JNI.
- Discussions and interviews with community members revealed that the community organizations work together to generate fund and implement school projects. A clear was a two classroom block built to lintel level through the joint efforts of the EDC, PTA and SBMC. The question is how these collaborative efforts towards school development be maintained and strengthened when funding starts flowing in for the SBMC? – Sustainability issue.

2.2 Outside the community
- Organizations outside the community that support school are the LGEA, MOE WOFAN and MOH in terms of immunization of the children and so on.

3.0 RESOURCES

3.1 The resources available in the school include:
- Vast land for school development
- Many teachers, but more than half do not have the minimum qualification for teaching.
- Effective and well coordinated community level organizations committed to school development.
- NGO support, e.g. WOFAN
- Text books available for teachers and exercise books for pupils
- Potable water
- Technical support from LGEA, MOE and MOH. Support to the school is in the area of policy guidelines, supervision and immunization of children

3.2 Resources lacking
- Inadequate number of classrooms
- Lack of teaching aids, toys for ECCD and also non availability of syllabus and scheme of work for the ECCD class.
- Inadequate number of seats in classrooms and a total lack of seats for the ECCD class.
- Inadequate number of qualified teachers

4.0 EXCLUSIVITY

- Records and discussions reveal a 17 member SBMC committee reportedly selected in a community meeting. Out of this the numbers of women are four and that of pupils two.
- However, it was found that there were up to four teachers on the SBMC contrary to the guidelines.
- Selection of SBMC members reported to have been conducted in a community meeting, implying it was democratic and not by selection.
- The pupils do not attend the SBMC meetings, implying lack of participation of pupils on the committee.

- Though members seem to be knowledgeable about the school development plan drawn by the SBMC, they are not as knowledgeable about the guidelines of the SBMC. This may be an indication of poor information flow on SBMC.
- The linkages among the key organizations (SBMC / PTA/EDC) that support the school are in the areas of membership and roles, responsibilities and common concerns for the school.

5.0 COMMUNICATION

5.1 School/Community level
- Concerns of the school are channelled to the PTA, EDC and the SBMC by the head teacher. Where necessary the matter is reported to the LGEA officials as well.
- The chief is notified of issues in the school that require his attention as the chief.
- A report from various community organizations on their activities and future plans are shared in a wider community meeting held in the chiefs palace. Women and children are excluded from the meeting due to cultural and religious grounds.

5.2 LGA/State level
- Polices and directives are given to the school from the LGEA. The school in turn reports to the community key organizations for action, e.g. formation of SBMC guidelines were said to have been sent to the school by the LGEA office.

INFLUENCE

- In terms of which organization has the greatest influence on the school, the EDC is seen as number 1 by both men and women. This is followed by the PTA and SBMC as well as the old boys all within the community.
- From outside the community it was reported that the LGEA MOE, MOH WOFAN exert a great influence.

Annex 5c: Kano Team Report

Background Information on Bechi, Kumbotso LGA, Kano

A. Bechi Area and Its People

- Bechi Pry School is one of the Semi Urban Schools chosen for the research.
- It is in Kumbotso Local Government Area (LGA)
- Bechi is a community established over a century ago by migrant Fulani cattle rearers, with a current population of about 4,000 people situated in the middle of 10 small hamlets which about a half Kilometre apart
- It is strategically located and is 15km away from Kano, 5km from Sharada Industrial Zone and with access to water, electricity and vast land for developmental activities
- Most of the youth in Bechi have had at least Primary education with some few members of the community occupying government position. For example, the village head is the PTA Coordinator in the Local Government

B. Bechi Primary School

- Bechi Primary School is one of the UPE schools established in 1976 with 50kids and currently has 420 pupils
- There are 3 blocks of classrooms housing Primary one to six with a school head teacher's office attached
- There are 5 toilets all in one block meant for the teachers, girls and boys
- There is well, a tap and a school field found in the school
- One of the school's blocks has its roof blown off. It was reported by the PTA/SBMC that efforts had been made 3 times to reroof the block
- There is no one single female teacher. LGEA representative explained the absence of female teachers to be as a result of posting difficulties particularly with respect to married women, who are finding it difficult to cope because of the distance factor

What are the structures supporting Bechi Pry School

- Venn diagram done with the community identified 12 structures and 3 institutions supporting the school. Among them are the newly formed SBMC, Community associations including women group as well the Local Government Education Authority (LGEA), State Universal Basic education (SUBEB) and Universal Basic Education (UBEC)
- Community associations include Students Association, Muslims Students Society, Farmers Association, Vigilante group, Youth Association, Amana group, Old Boys, Self Help Group
- The LGEA identified as the second most significant structure is mainly concern with the deployment of the teachers and payment of their salaries

while the SUBEB and UBEC are mainly concern with Supervision and policy matters

- Old Boys has been identified prominently in its role of arranging extra lessons for the pupils as well conduct of non formal education classes
- PTA has been single out as the most significant structure supporting the school in terms of school awareness creation, school repairs and maintenance
- SBMC mainly formed 2 months ago is yet to be identified with any significant impact but has made its presence felt in mobilising the community members for this research
- Apart from the school structures few notable individuals including the current SBMC else while Councillor were identified to have been supporting the school financially and in the provision of new school uniforms to the pupils
- Toilets were also built through the efforts of PTA and other community associations

SBMC Functionality
- SBMC was formed about 2 Months ago with only 6 members. The SBMC Chairman was selected by the village Head but through recognition of his track records in the community. The rest members included the PTA Chair, the Village Head but excluded prominent representations from pupils, women and artisans.
- There was no record of any meeting or achievements made under the SBMC platform
- The SBMC Chair admitted during the Social Resource Mapping that he would need help about what the SBMC was intended for and how its operational guidelines
- There was a general lack of clarity to the intentions and operational guidelines of the SBMC by all the SBMC members until the coming of the research team
- Even though posters for the formation of SBMC were brought the school community as admitted by the head teacher, he admitted as well other members of the community that no detailed explanations or dissemination of the SBMC guidelines
- SBMC guidelines was apparently missing in the school even though one of the SUBEB staff among the research team admitted all the schools had been provided with the guidelines
- Even though SBMC was newly formed and was not well constituted before the research, it demonstrated hope for future by the arranging a forum to strengthen the membership of the SBMC as well as mobilising and arranging

logistics at the community level to see to the success of the research. SBMC Chair also articulated vision for the SBMC during the Community feedback meeting

Inclusivity
- At the commencement of the research the SBMC has been reconstituted to include all the required 17 representatives
- Hitherto to the research, children, artisans, key leaders of the associations, representatives from other catchment areas and women were conspicuously left out of the SBMC

School/Community Resources
- Social resources in the community range from primary school, households, health centre, motor park, roads including the newly constructed by pass bus top to market
- Natural resources include farmlands, river, dam
- There are up to 12 structures supporting the Primary School as mentioned earlier
- The Primary School has turned in Councillors and PTA Coordinators in the LGA
- Books for the people exist but were admitted to be inadequate
- Wall Charts were conspicuously missing from the classes
- 5 toilets exist but all in one block for use by the teachers, girls and boys
- Other resources have been listed under the Schools' background

Communication:
- Communication channel between the school and the parent is through the PTA. The PTA Chair liaises between the school and the parents
- Communication between the SBMC and the community is unclear as SBMC was in the state of limbo before the commencement of the research
- Channel of communication between the LGEA and the School and vise–versa has largely been through the PTA coordinator who is the Village Head as the School Supervisor from the LGEA who happens to a female.
- There is no established line of communication even the SBMC guideline

Influence
- The key actors influencing the school have been outlined under the section of structures that support the school
- Largely influence on the school were from both community structures and individuals
- Relative contributions to the school in terms of finance, material, moral formed bases of any influence

- Apparently, the Village head, SBMC Chair, PTA Chair and few notable individuals are very influential in the community and by extension the school
- It is unclear how influential the head teacher and remaining colleagues are in the community during this research

Key Findings on the Tools:
- The tools seem to be adequate in exploring issues of governance, gender and equity from the perspective of school, SBMC and community at large
- The questions are simple and could easily understood
- The tools seem to be too many for a case study with a well defined focus – Policy and practice
- For a specialised area of research, emphasis could be more focused on key informants on specific issues rather than individual interviews
- Some of the tools may require specific instructions for the purpose of guidance
- Possibility of research tool guide may be useful to facilitate understanding and standardisation
- The tools may required fine tuning within the context of different scenarios – SBMC functionality
- The tools may require also fine tuning to respond effectively to objectives 1 and 3 of the research e.g. forced choice exercise for objective 1 and force field exercise for objective 3
- Field reporting format as a tool is also needed to ease analysis and reporting

Annex 5d: Kwara Team Report

Background

Garun Malam Special Primary School is located at Garun Malam Village in Garun Malam LGA of Kano State, a distance of about 35km from the State Capital, Kano City. The Community is endowed with various institutions such as a Health Centre, Police Station, District Head Palace, Mosque, Islamiyya School, Junior Secondary and another Primary School at the outskirts of the village. The Village Head's House is located in a central place just behind the village mosque. It is a community of predominantly farmers who specialize in the production of rice, onions, tomatoes and animal husbandry.

Community Structures that Support the School

It was observed that the community Leader & the District Head are conversant with the happenings in the school environment and are willing to support both old and new initiatives towards the development of the school. It was discovered that the PTA is a strong entity working closely with the SBMC with two of their members being members of the SBMC.

The Women Farmers Association (WOFAN) is also very prominent in the development of the community. In the school, there is an on-going construction of 4 new toilets by WOFAN. In addition to this, the PTA is constructing a staff room and an office for the Head Teacher.

Another interesting feature of the school is the presence of the Local Government Education Area (LGEA) office within the school premises giving it proximity to Local Government presence. Other structures that support the school include Religious Organizations, Farmers Union, and Prominent Personalities within & outside the Community and Youths.

Resources

Garun Malam is a rural community, yet the people have been responsive to some of the needs of the school. They are predominantly farmers, but have quite a few educated men who work in the education, health agricultural sectors within the community. It is a well resourced primary school with 8 blocks of 17 classrooms inclusive of a 2 classroom block for Early Childcare Education (ECCE). There are adequate toilet facilities for both teachers and pupils. Also in the school, there are 2 functional water points (1 borehole and an open well). The population of the school pupils is 863, boys – 577 and girls – 286. There are 27 teachers and 1 Librarian. The teachers are made up of 24 males and 3 females. All the pupils have access to major text books in Mathematics and English, but they can neither read nor write. Though the school is funded by resources from the LGEA, it is privileged to get support from various interventions, the latest of which is State Education Support Project (SESP). It was observed that a cross-section of the stakeholders have a good knowledge of important institutions in the community. For instance, they could identify the locations easily through the social mapping conducted.

Inclusivity

The composition of the SBMC on the Guidelines seemed to have been followed by the school community as the list displayed at the Head Teacher's Office connotes. However, the children are only there on paper. In reality, neither the Head Boy nor Head Girl is invited to any of the meetings. The women on the SBMC are only 3 and they are passive participants.

Communication

There seems to be good information flow among PTA Executives and SBMC. The channel of communication between Head Teacher & the SBMC is well understood. Speaking with groups of women & other community members, men and women outside the SBMC and the leadership of the community do not know about the existence of the SBMC. There is also no communication with the pupils who are primary stakeholders in the SBMC. It was observed that only children of the SBMC adult members seem to have idea of its existence & some of the proceedings. The passive participation of the women in the SBMC found its expression in the knowledge displayed by a cross-section of the women in the community. It was also

clear that representatives of different groups on the SBMC do not disseminate information about the proceedings to the larger groups they represent.

Influence

It was observed that the Head Teacher and SBMC members are aware of the accountability structures. The Head Teacher knows he is accountable to the LGEA and partially to the SBMC. The SBMC members also know that they are accountable to the community and the school authority.

The male group noted that the District Head is the most powerful & influential personality. Whereas the women felt the Village Head is the most influential since they do not have access to the District Head.

On the SBMC, it was agreed that decisions are collectively made and consensus are reached on contentious issues such as school needs, supplies renovations, etc.

Notes:

Reflecting every day. May even hypothesize.

Annex 5e: Lagos Team Report

1.   Background

The LGA has ten wards, five of them being part of Sabon Gari. Kurna is in D2 ward, which has a very young Ward Head who has taken over from his aged father. Both have shown interest in the research and the old father made the particular point that teachers need to be better paid.

The school is near the centre of Kano with a sign a short way behind it reading *Kwakwaci Mechanic Village*.

The school mainly takes children from the Police Barracks. There are both traditional and modern elements in the community make-up.

- We met a lot of highly educated women in the community but only one highly educated man whom the female researchers saw when visiting his wife. We were unable to visit men's groups.
- The educated elite have their children in private schools.

Community structures:

The women met during the research belong to the Al'amanat Women's Association and support the school out of charity, even though their own children do not go there.

At Local Government level

The research team visited the Education Secretary of the LGEA, the SMBC Co-ordinator, and the District Head. All were interested in the school and gave every co-operation for the research. Their hospitality was generous and they had souvenir photographs taken.

At school level

SPS Kurna is well staffed with an active Head Teacher, a committed SBMC Chairman (a local businessman), a well educated Treasurer who banks all monies and is also the PTA chairman – he uses his professional knowledge to keep the school first-aid box well stocked.

2.   Resources

- There are good school buildings though there is a hole in the class 2a floor that could probably be repaired with only one bag of cement.
- There are attractive children's books in the school library but children were observed in class without textbooks. The SBMC Co-ordinator complained that World Bank did not send enough book for the large number of children in the Kano schools.
- The Ward has several Islamiya Schools. It was explained that the children attend in the afternoons after secular school.
- In one house visited there was a blackboard and materials for Islamiya lessons to be given at home.
- The SBMC, PTA, and Al'amanat Women's Association ass levy to pay for chalk, furniture repairs, exercise-books, first aid, uniforms for poor children and school fees for orphans.

There are 47 school staff for 13 classes: one Early Childhood class and 12 primary classes. Teachers have a fairly equal gender balance and adequate levels of qualification: NCE 12, Grade II teachers 11. The children are taught by subject specialists rather than have one teacher for all subjects. They also attend library for 35 minutes per class each week. The librarian is female.

Pupils

In the 12 primary classes 1 – 6 (double streamed) there are 332 boys and 305 girls, each class having more boys than girls except class 3 where there are 40 boys and 68 girls.

Spot checks on class 2a and 4b showed well kept registers, with few children leaving the school

Ages of children in 4b ranged from 9 to 20 years, with the median around 12 years. Three boys had left since last term and one was off sick.

Enrolment is high, with all classes fuller than the ideal. Class 2a had 68 children with 23 sitting on the floor. Walking round the neighbourhood there was no sign of out of school children such as are seen in other towns, though there were *almajiri* begging in traffic jams.

Children's organisations: children themselves organise cultural clubs and other activities in the school, according to informants. They were observed during a PE lessons without a teacher organising themselves for games, the girls in a circle and the boys playing football.

There is a Head Boy, a Head Girl, 28 prefects (18 of them female) and separate monitors. This information was given by the Head Boy, who attends the SBMC meetings and carries a whip to discipline children at school closing time.

3.   Inclusivity

- There are more boys than girls
- There appear to be very few Christian children despite the fact that the catchment area includes Police Barracks and the school is near Sabon Gari where non-Hausa people mainly live.
- There are Igbo and Yoruba shops near the Barracks. The only person interviewed was a Yoruba woman who said she sent all her children to private schools.
- Some parents complained that they don't always get invited to PTA meetings in time
- Parents avoid SBMC meetings because they don't want to pay levies
- Women attend SBMC meetings but are not involved in key decisions
- Financial decisions sometimes have to be made in haste by the Head Teacher together with the SBMC Chairman and the SBMC Treasurer.

4   Communication

- Communication on important issues is received from government
- Women and children don't know anything about SBMC and PTA members

The community are aware of problems in the classrooms in terms of the effectiveness of teaching and learning but they do not transmit these concerns upwards to Local Government. Interviews showed that community members are well award of problems but instead of trying to improve interactions in the school they prefer to send their children to private schools.

- They only do what the Local Government tells them to do and they do not see it as part of their job to try to change schools for the better
- They don't go to class
- They don't complain about lack of books to read
- They do, however, contribute money to cover gaps in government funding.

Examples of communication up the system during the research:

It was interesting to note in the community feedback meeting that a boy in class 5 or 6 said teachers should be trained to teach very well. The old Ward Head met two days before said something similar when he urged the Federal Government to pay teachers better in order to improve their performance.

Communication to children

The Head Boy and Head Girl attend SBMC meetings but do not talk. They claim that the do pass on information to the prefects and monitors about what happened in the meetings. There was no chance to verify this. Most children interviewed did not know of the existence of SBMC and confused it with PTA.

5. Influence

There are a few people in multiple roles, so that, for example, a woman who is a teacher may be a member of the Al'amanat Association and also a member of the SBMC.

Most of the work of the SBMC is done by the Chairman and the Treasurer, who seem to be genuine philanthropists dedicated to raising up the community.

SBMC members are chosen by both election and selection. It appears that it is difficult to get the 12 other members fully involved because of the personal sacrifice needed.

Many people do not know of the existence of the SBMC.

The Local Government SBMC Co-ordinator was the chief source of information to the research team.

His interest and dedication were outstanding and we thank him for staying with us all the time.

We should also like to thank the SBMC Chairman, the Head Teacher and his staff and children, the Al'amanat Women's Association, the Education Secretary, the District Head and Ward Heads, all SBMC and PTA members and all community members for their help and friendship.

Mrs Jane Olatunji-Hughes

Mrs Tina Obanubi Ade

Mr 'Biodun Johnson Fowomola

Annex 6:   Email to STLs

Dear ESSPIN State Team Leaders

I have spoken at least briefly to all of you about the SBMC research during the recent piloting phase, with the exception of Abolaji (sorry we didn't get to talk - I tried you on Monday but understand it was a very busy day for you). I'm writing to you now with some information about this forthcoming piece of research under component 4.

1 Overview

This research seeks to explore how SBMC policy has been implemented. It looks at how various community institutions, including SBMCs, are supporting schools. It tries to understand some of the dynamics in policy and practice around these institutions at community level and how they relate to LGEA, state and federal level.

This is a qualitative piece of research focusing on 10 case studies spread across the ESSPIN states. It is not a survey, rather it seeks to look in depth at a variety of cases, covering a variety of interventions including GEP, SESP, COMPASS as well as looking at schools that have had no direct intervention. It will attempt to draw out lessons for ESSPIN by analysing & understanding what works, where and under what circumstances.

The methodology is based on in-depth observations, interviews and PRA tools over a period of 5 days in each community, as well as interviews with LGEA, state and federal level officials.

2 Case study selection

Selection of case studies is purposive. We are interested in including for the most part schools where something is happening or has happened in relation to SBMCs, through interventions including GEP, SESP, COMPASS. We are also interested in selecting some cases where there has been no intervention, since from what we have seen so far during piloting there are plenty of cases with 'home-grown' institutions supporting schools. Proposed case study selection is as follows:

		Interventions	location
Kano 1	Primary	None	Peri-urban
Kano 2	Primary	SESP	Rural
Kaduna 1	Primary	SESP	Peri-urban
Kaduna 2	Primary	None	Rural
Kwara 1	Primary	SESP	Urban
Kwara 2	Primary	none	Rural
Jigawa 1	Primary	GEP 1	Rural
Jigawa 2	Primary	GEP 2	Rural
Lagos 1	Primary	COMPASS	Urban
Lagos 2	JSS	None	Urban